

**AAQTF Meeting Summary and Decisions**  
**November 13 and 15, 2005**  
**Wailea, Maui, Hawaii**

**AAQTF Members in Attendance:**

- Viney Aneja
- Janet Ashman
- Robert Avant
- Gary Baise
- Garth Boyd
- Nan Bunker
- Cynthia Cory
- Manuel Cunha
- Robert Flocchini
- Roger Isom
- Robert Jackman
- Steven Kirkhorn
- Bruce Knight (Chair, USDA-NRCS)
- Calvin Parnell
- Marc Pitchford
- Kevin Rogers
- Dave Roper
- Joseph Rudek
- William Schillinger
- Rita Sharma
- Annette Sharp
- Sally Shaver (EPA)
- Bryan Shaw
- Douglas Shelmidine
- Phillip Wakelyn

**USDA Staff in Attendance:**

- Mike Arbaugh (USFS)
- John Brenner (NRCS)
- Carl Coon (NRCS)
- Meredith Dahl (OGC)
- Ranae Ganske (NRCS)
- Diane Gelburd, DFO (NRCS)
- Ron Heavner (NRCS)
- Ray Knighton (CSREES)
- Greg Johnson (NRCS)
- Sheryl Kunickis (NRCS)
- Jolene Lau (NRCS)
- Terrence Lynch (ARS)
- Cheryl Morton (NRCS)
- Marc Ribaud (ERS)
- Jeff Schmidt (NRCS)
- Chris Smith (NRCS)
- Margaret Walsh (NRCS)
- Robert Wright (ARS)
- Larry Yamamoto (NRCS)
- Greg Zwicke (NRCS)

**EPA Staff in Attendance:**

- Jim Blubaugh
- Kerry Drake
- Robin Dunkins
- Linda Metcalf
- Beth Sauerhaft
- Jon Scholl

## **Summary of Day One November 13, 2005**

Designated Federal Official (DFO) Diane Gelburd called the meeting to order at 8:00 a.m. on Sunday November 13.

### **Minutes**

The minutes from the June 2005 AAQTF meeting in Amarillo, TX were approved by the Task Force.

### **Introductions**

Deputy USDA Undersecretary for Natural Resources and Environment Merlyn Carlson emphasized the importance of science-based policies, decision making, and conservation practices, particularly through USDA's AAQTF, partnerships and initiatives such as the White House Conference on Cooperative Conservation. He discussed USDA's interest in including the trading of greenhouse gas and carbon credits in the next Farm Bill.

The Mayor of Maui, Alan Arakawa, emphasized the utility of locally-produced biodiesel fuels and the use of cane residues for electric generation on the islands, given their remoteness. He stressed problems facing agriculture on the island, including land conversion to residential uses, the limited availability of irrigation water, invasive species, and erosion.

Sandra Kunimoto, Hawaii's Board of Agriculture Chair and head of the State Department of Agriculture, discussed Hawaii's unique geographic and environmental situation and its impacts on agriculture, including the diversity of environments to be found there, the impact of the "Kona" Winds, which transport volcanic gases including sulfur dioxide (H<sub>2</sub>S) from the Big Island to the other Hawaiian Islands, and H<sub>2</sub>S issues resulting from lava flows into the ocean. The average size of Hawaii's approximately 5500 farms is 5 acres, and 86% are privately owned. Crops produced on the islands include specialty crops, pineapple, sugar, energy crops, coffee, and seed crops.

Larry Yamamoto, Hawaii's NRCS State Conservationist, introduced the committee to the ecology and environment of the Pacific islands, including Hawaii, Palau, the Marianas, Micronesia, and others. Air Quality issues involve burning, dust, wind, volcanic air pollution, and animal waste. Mr. Yamamoto reviewed community education programs and specific measures being implemented to mitigate those effects. Discussion following Mr. Yamamoto's talk centered on the application of CRP and WRP in Hawaii to mitigate wind erosion and the associated challenges of program implementation.

Deputy Undersecretary for Rural Development, Tom Dorr explained the mission of USDA's Rural Development Agency of increasing economic opportunity and quality of life in rural America. Two million people are involved in agriculture nationally,

investing \$63 Billion dollars per year. Rural Development provides leadership, investment capital, and technical assistance. Economic opportunities exist in renewable energy such as ethanol, biodiesel, waste recovery and conversion to energy products, digestors, wind, and solar power.

## **EPA Updates**

Jon Scholl provided updates on three program goals:

1. Making cross-media issues more effective for agriculture and accounting for tradeoffs. A Cross-Media Agriculture Team has been formed.
2. Developing tools, markets, and definitions for ecological activities.
3. Constructing environmental management systems that are relevant to agricultural interests.

Upcoming EPA decisions which impact agriculture:

1. The process of developing proposals for the CAFO rule will be out in early 2006.
2. Determination regarding when and if NPDES permits are needed for the application of pesticides.
3. Draft rule regarding the banking and trading of renewable fuels is expected in March 2006.
4. A proposal will be published in the near future dealing with the impacts of the SPCC rule on agriculture.

The discussion following Mr. Scholl's presentation revealed that:

1. EPA has had discussions on how we can partner with NRCS on programs such as the West Coast Collaborative.
2. EPA's focus regarding cross media issues has been primarily on CAFO issues, though VOCs and chemical drift will be addressed, as well. Because all media affect agriculture, the efforts being made to forward this issue were appreciated by the task force.
3. It was noted that the SPCC rule affected agriculture in unanticipated ways and that modern agriculture voluntarily implements environmental management systems.
4. EPA and USDA are both looking into the impacts of the livestock industry on human health.
5. The committee expressed concern regarding tracking of their recommendations within EPA, including the agricultural burning policy for which a status report was requested.
6. The accuracy of the monitors to be used for PM-Coarse was questioned.

Sally Shaver presented a discussion on four topics:

1. Changes to the ozone implementation rule (see <http://www.epa.gov/ozonedesignations/regs.htm>) and the National Ambient Air Quality Standard review schedule for ozone.
2. Inclusion of hydrogen sulfide and diesel exhaust in the Hazardous Air Pollutant listing.
3. Current status of the Animal Feeding Operation Consent Agreement and Monitoring Study. EPA plans to work with USDA to implement the monitoring study and the subsequent methodology development. EPA will also consider independent research data in this effort. The consent agreements will be reviewed by the EPA Environmental Appeals Board (EAB). The database of participants will be publicly available in the spring/summer of 2006. The guidance for estimating emissions will use data from the study and other pertinent data and be published for comment and review. It was stated that guidance for producers is necessary so they may determine their regulatory obligations.
4. The Air Strategy Assessment Program (ASAP). The committee requested further information regarding the validation and verification of these modeling tools. The selection criteria for models and data included in the program were discussed. The application of this program to community-level decision making and to PM NAAQS decision making were discussed.

Other subjects considered included

1. Security concerns regarding the availability of farm data to the public through the EAB were related.
2. The adequacy of the sample sizes used for assessing air quality impacts on occupational human health was mentioned, and a lack of funding for that work.

### **Technical Presentations**

Mr. Barclay Rogers of Fogleman & Rogers discussed recent CERCLA/EPCRA court cases including Sierra Club versus Seaboard Farms and Sierra Club versus Tyson Foods. Mr. Rogers concluded his presentation with a discussion of the EPA Consent Agreement. Mr. Rogers supports the collection of quality data but opposes an “amnesty for data” approach.

Meredith Dahl of the USDA Office of General Council (OGC) presented information from the USDA’s legal perspective relating to the definition of agricultural air quality terms. OGC is separate from NRCS, providing counsel to the Department of Agriculture and its agencies. Items which the task force recommends to the Secretary are reviewed by OGC based on 1) the Secretary’s authority to act on the recommendation, and 2) the authority given to the AAQTF in their charter.

Sean O’Keefe, head of Environmental Affairs at Alexander & Baldwin, discussed local sugar cane growing, harvesting, and processing practices in Hawaii. Mr. O’Keefe expanded upon the environmental management and regulation to which they adhere,

including burning practices prior to cane harvesting, smoke management, and air quality monitoring.

### **Committee Reports**

The Policy Subcommittee requested that the full AAQTF review the documents titled “Background Material Supporting Recommendations to Define Certain Terms” and “Definitions for Consideration” via its chairman, Mr. Gary Baise for consideration by the full AAQTF. Discussion included a recommendation that a working group consisting of EPA, USDA, and DOI personnel was necessary in order to adequately define agricultural air quality terms.

The Education and Outreach Subcommittee’s chair Annette Sharp and the subcommittee’s liaison to the NRCS, John Brenner, gave a demonstration of an interactive online informational brochure of agricultural air quality issues and resources. The AAQTF voted to launch the website and NRCS agreed to support its maintenance.

Emerging Issues Chair Roger Isom introduced subcommittee member Cynthia Cory, who presented the AAQTF with a draft entitled “Climate Change/Global Warming and Agriculture.” The Subcommittee reported on the progress of AAQTF efforts to stimulate research and funding for VOC emission research.

Research Subcommittee Chair Bob Avant presented their concerns regarding implementation of the PM<sub>2.5</sub> standard and the impending standards for PM<sub>2.5</sub> and PM coarse fraction (PM<sub>10-2.5</sub>) with a document entitled “Agricultural Air Quality Research Priorities.” The need for technical analysis of implementation strategy, analysis of implications of the proposed rules to agriculture, and comments for EPA were expressed.

The meeting was adjourned by Chairman Chief Bruce Knight at 7:00 p.m.

### **Summary of Day Two November 15, 2005**

DFO Dr. Diane Gelburd called the meeting to order at 7:00 a.m. on Tuesday November 15.

### **USDA Updates**

Deputy Chief for Science and Technology Larry Clark provided the NRCS Agricultural Air Quality Technology Update, focusing on NRCS programs and air quality-related activities. The AAQTF’s discussion that followed included concern regarding the proposal application and follow-up processes, the composition of the panel reviewers for the Conservation Innovation Grant (CIG) proposals, the need for the CIG review panel members to understand geography-specific farming conservation issues, and the need for quantification and validation of the environmental benefits gained from NRCS’s programs.

CSREES representative Dr. Ray Knighton described for the AAQTF the National Research Initiative Air Quality Program and representative projects which it has funded. He noted that state and federal budget cuts may force the shut down of several NADP atmospheric deposition research/monitoring stations. AAQTF discussion included pointing out a perceived disconnect between research review, project approval, the AAQTF itself, and input from farm groups. Mr. Knighton followed up by describing NRI panel composition and process.

Dr. Robert Wright provided the report on behalf of ARS, including budget projections and research program changes. AAQTF comments addressed their appreciation of ARS research efforts and direction on air quality issues.

Due to temporal constraints, an update of USFS activities by Dr. Mike Arbaugh was voluntarily postponed until the next AAQTF meeting.

### **Technical Presentations**

Mr. Bruce Polkowsky of the National Park Service provided an Overview of the Regional Haze Rule and Implications for Agriculture. Noted agricultural activities included fire and burning, tillage, and applications of ammonia fertilizers. Data collection by regional planning air quality groups and their work to establish natural baseline conditions, what current conditions are, identifying source attribution, helping states to determine mitigation strategies, and advise EPA. AAQTF discussion focused on those issues, as well as rule implementation and applicability, emission estimation methodologies, and the impact of global transport processes on the evaluation process.

Dr. Marc Pitchford of NOAA and AAQTF member described for the AAQTF the Interpretation of Regional Haze Monitoring Data for Hawaii and causes of haze in the state's two Class I designated areas. AAQTF discussion included follow-up regarding how the analysis was conducted, potential alternative sources of haze on the Islands, the location and representativeness of monitoring equipment, and the impact of insurance company policies on agricultural burning practices. A concern was raised regarding the National Acid Deposition Program's (NADP) adequacy for monitoring rural health, suggesting that a monitoring network is needed for agricultural emissions and their effects (both positive and negative) on agricultural ecosystems.

Mr. Ron Nagata, Chief of the Division of Resources Management at Haleakala National Park, gave a slideshow of the flora, fauna, and ecosystems of the Park and the problems they face, including threats from invasive species. His slides included pictures of agricultural burning and of the different degrees of diminished visibility that may arise from volcanic emissions.

The Director of EPA's National Clean Diesel Campaign, Jim Blubaugh, presented an overview of the Program, the role for agriculture, successes, technology verification,

funding, and congressional authorization. AAQTF discussion focused on the definitions of “typical” farm equipment, the virtue of replacement versus retrofitting, and the opportunities presented by energy enhancements. NRCS agreed to meet with Mr. Blubaugh to discuss potential synergies with the CSP program.

Mr. Bob Avant of the AAQTF presented an overview of the White House Conference on Cooperative Conservation, held in August 2005 and attended by several AAQTF members. The importance of interagency collaborations, particularly with respect to cross-media issues was stressed by Conference speakers. AAQTF discussion noted that the need for definitions relating to agriculture and environment was a clear and consistent theme presented by federal speakers at the Conference. Members additionally expressed concern that agriculture is being regulated by multiple organizations, and requested coordination of research and programmatic efforts by NRCS.

Dr. Marc Ribaldo presented the Economic Research Service’s (USDA) report on Managing Manure to Improve Air and Water Quality, which concludes in part that tradeoffs between air and water are prevalent in manure nitrogen management, and that uncoordinated policies would impose extra costs on farmers. Discussion focused primarily on the details of the survey, and an AAQTF briefing on NRCS’s Field Office Technical Guide was offered for a future meeting.

Dr. Bryan Shaw reviewed new details in the Buckeye Farms case, including the appropriateness of using TSP measurements as a proxy for PM<sub>10</sub>, as well as other standards and estimates applied in the case. Discussion regarding legal implantation, guidance, and recourse in such cases followed.

Sally Shaver (EPA and AAQTF) presented discussions on three related topics:

- The NAAQS PM Review, which will be completed by September 2006, includes recommendations to replace the current PM<sub>10</sub> indicator with PM<sub>10-2.5</sub> as well as the revocation of the annual standard. Discussion focused on regional considerations that would make meeting the new standards difficult, distinguishing between rural and urban particulate matter, and the non-equivalence to the old standard of the proposed changes. It was noted that previous speciation monitoring has focused largely on urban areas Health effects are based on PM in urban areas.
- Implementation of the PM<sub>2.5</sub> Program, which will be finalized in the summer/fall of 2006. Details of achieving attainment and data collection were discussed, and the need for interagency review was suggested.
- The Exceptional Events Policy proposed in conjunction with the PM NAAQS Standard. Specific examples of events and their potential designation as exceptional were discussed. Issues relating to vehicles entering the US under NAFTA and not subject to local or regional emission standards were discussed.

## **Committee Reports and Actions**

The Research Subcommittee's recommendations regarding PM and contained in the document submitted to the Committee on the previous meeting day were revisited following EPA's presentation, and were approved by the AAQTF for submission to the Secretary of Agriculture.

Discussion of the Policy Subcommittee's recommendations included stating the need and precedents for agricultural atmospheric and multimedia definitions, along with the specifics of the draft definitions and the concern regarding their complexity and their scientific basis. A motion was carried to request an interagency working group be formed to develop useful definitions, and that the Policy Subcommittee continue to develop definitions themselves including the substantive comments of other AAQTF members.

**Next Meeting**

The next meeting will be held during the week of February 26, 2006 in the Washington, DC area.

The following meeting will be on June 9, 2006, also in the Washington, DC area. It will follow the Workshop on Agricultural Air Quality at the Bolger Conference Center.

Table 1. Requested Presentations

<b>Presenter</b>	<b>Subject</b>
RAP Representative	Estimating the emission factors used for O <sub>3</sub> and PM <sub>2.5</sub> modeling.
U.S. Department of State	Impacts of international emissions (including cross-boundary transport and NAFTA) on monitoring
NRCS Representative	Field Office Technical Guide
EPA	Document Tracking and Accountability
EPA	ASAP Model
NRCS Representative	Demonstration of NRCS's Air Quality Tools
USDA Secretary Johanns	AAQTF and the USDA
EPA Administrator Johnson	AAQTF and the EPA
EPA	Use of the Midwest Scaling Method in VOC monitoring.
None specifically identified	CA VOC monitoring methods, exemptions, and BACTs
Bill Becker, STAPPA/ALAPCO	State & Local Regulatory Considerations for Agriculture

The meeting was adjourned by Chairman Chief Bruce Knight at 7:00 p.m. on November 15, 2005.